



**York Historical Architectural Review Board
Meeting Minutes
March 22, 2018**

Members in attendance included W. Craig Zumbrun, Chairperson; Dennis Kunkle; Mark Shermeyer; Mark Skehan; Dave Redshaw; Teresa Johnescu

Absent: Justine Landis; Becky Zeller; Robin Pottorff

Consultant: Christine Leggio, Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant, JMT

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
Welcome and call to order W. Craig Zumbrun, Chair	The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm. The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.	A quorum was present.
Changes to the Agenda	N/A	N/A
Minutes of February 22, 2018	Motion to approve by Mark Shermeyer, seconded by Dennis Kunkle. A vote was taken with all in favor.	The minutes from the meeting held February 22, 2018 were approved with no changes.
Cases	The following cases are forwarded to York City council with the recommended actions.	

Case #1 – 146 S Newberry Street

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing Masonite siding with new vinyl siding to match the existing in color and approximate profile. The existing siding is in deteriorated condition and water is leaking to the interior of the property. The applicant is pursuing vinyl replacement due to financial constraints.

Minutes: The homeowner, Steven Young, was present at the start of the meeting, but the applicant, Chad M. Howard, of Rick’s Home Improvements, was not. Mr. Young stated that he didn’t realize vinyl would be a problem and noted that he is open to direction from the Board. He explained that a sag in the gutter caused dripped onto the windowsill, which was capped with a vinyl or other plastic substance that had cracked, caused rotting to the underside of the sill. He stated that water penetration and freeze thaw cycling to the siding over the years had caused the existing Masonite siding to crack.

Mr. Shermeyer noted that Masonite siding was considered a superior product in the 1980s but today it is less highly regarded. He noted that the brickmold appears to be pine from the 1980s, when the houses on this block were restored. The homeowner stated he is looking into replacing the sill with a higher quality wood. Mr. Shermeyer noted that alternative materials, though not vinyl, could be considered. Azek or other PVC product for the window trim/surround would be appropriate.

Mr. Shermeyer recommended that the Board would like to see fiber cement board on the front façade at minimum, and vinyl could be allowed on the rear. Mr. Young noted that he got a quote for fiber cement board which was approximately \$10,000 for a single wall, and Mr. Shermeyer noted that that price seemed excessive.

Mr. Young noted that he contacted as many as eight contractors and only two were willing or able to provide quotes. One recommended vinyl and proposed that the Board may allow it if it looked like wood. Mr. Shermeyer and Ms. Johnescu stated that the Board would not approve vinyl siding. Mr. Shermeyer reiterated that it wouldn't be appropriate on the front or side elevations due to their high visibility.

The Chad M. Howard and an associate arrived at 6:08 (noting problems accessing the building due to a locked door) and Mr. Young informed him that vinyl siding would not be permitted. Mr. Zumbrun proceeded to explain that vinyl and aluminum are not allowed to be used on highly visible elevations within the historic district because it does not weather, looks too modern, and is not appropriate to the character of the district when visible from the right-of-way. He notes that the Board is sensitive to the increased cost of products such as Azek and fiber cement board but notes that it is more durable and does not have to be replaced as often. He noted that it also has inherent value in that it maintains the quality of the historic district.

Mr. Zumbrun asked whether the contractor has had experience using a fiber cement board, and he confirmed he had. Mr. Shermeyer recommended fiber cement siding products other than HardiPlank that would perform as well but could be available at lower cost be priced for comparison.

Mr. Shermeyer noted that the neighborhood was restored in the 1980s, and the addition dates to that period.

Mr. Redshaw noted that if only the front façade were to be replaced, aligning the new siding with the boards on the side would not be critical and noted that it would be a durable material at the location of the mulch bed at the front of the building. Mr. Kunkle stated that fiber cement board is rot resistant, insect resistant, and more durable than vinyl.

Mr. Zumbrun noted that the Board could approve the application if it were amended to say that the front façade would be replaced with a fiber cement board or other appropriate product. He noted that if the homeowner were not able to do so, the Board would likely recommend denial of the vinyl siding.

Mr. Howard asked whether it needed to be fiber cement board, or if it could be wood. The Board agreed that they would approve wood, but it would have to be a durable species, such as cedar. Mr. Shermeyer strongly recommends pricing products other than Hardiplank in addition to cedar for price comparisons.

Mr. Skehan asked whether gutter repair was proposed. The homeowner noted that it would be rehung. Mr. Skehan noted that it appears to be missing some clips.

Motion: A motion was made by Mr. Shermeyer to approve application amended as follows: to replace the existing siding at the front façade with an appropriate wood siding, in cedar or similar material, or a fiber cement siding, such as Hardi Plank, Allura, or similar; or with another similar composite board material which imitates wood siding. The window trim shall be replaced with back-primed wood in an

appropriate species, or a similar composite material product, such as Azek or a similar product, to match the existing profiles.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Redshaw. A vote was taken with all in favor.

**Adjourning and next meeting The meeting was adjourned
upon motion by Mr.
Zumbrun, seconded by Ms.
Johnescu, at 6:29 pm.**

Minutes recorded by Christine Leggio, Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant, JMT.