



**York Historical Architectural Review Board
Meeting Minutes
May 10, 2018**

Members in attendance included: Dennis Kunkle (Vice-Chair), Teresa Johnescu, Dave Redshaw, Robyn Pottorff, Mark Shermeyer

Absent: Rebecca Zeller, Justine Landis, Craig Zumbrun (Chair), Mark Skehan

Consultant: Mary Alfson Tinsman, JMT Cultural Resource Manager/ HARB Consultant

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
Welcome and call to order	The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm. The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.	
Changes to the Agenda		None
Minutes of April 12, 2018		Mr. Shermeyer moved to approve April 12, 2018 minutes Ms. Johnescu seconded. Approved.
Cases	The following cases are approved with the recommended actions.	

Case #1 – 44-50 W. Market Street

A request by Al Kutcher for the replacement of three existing wood windows on the second story of the front façade of the property with new vinyl replacement windows. The proposed work will include a change in the size of the windows, with the existing openings being 26” wide by 57” high, and the proposed windows being 29” wide by 38” high. The windows have already been installed on the building. Mr. Kutcher presented his application. He noted that he was told by City staff that the windows needed to be replaced. He admitted that the windows had already been changed prior to the HARB meeting.

Mr. Kunkle asked if the previous windows were in poor condition, and the applicant indicated yes. Mr. Kunkle asked if the City staff were aware that the size of the windows were changed. The applicant indicated that when he went to the permit office they told him he would need to attend the HARB meeting. He did not state if the City staff were aware that the size of the windows had changed.

Mr. Shermeyer noted that if you retain the size of the windows you do not need a permit. Mr. Redshaw concurred. The applicant indicated that the existing windows were the closest that he could find at Lowes/Home Depot without ordering special windows. The applicant noted that the other windows on the house were changed prior to his owning the property (pre-2010). Mr. Redshaw noted a concern regarding replacing wood windows with vinyl windows. Mr. Shermeyer added that his concern was the change in the size of the window opening. Mr. Redshaw asked if the other windows that were replaced had been reduced in size, and the applicant indicated he was not sure.

Mr. Shermeyer asked for the HARB consultant opinion. Ms. Alfson Tinsman indicated that appropriately sized windows should be installed to be compliant with the Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Ms. Johnescu noted that she would not approve the application as presented; correctly sized windows are needed. Mr. Shermeyer concurred, as did Ms. Pottorff. Mr. Shermeyer noted that vinyl might be acceptable, but that the sizes of the windows needs to be corrected. The applicant noted that they could replace the new windows with appropriately sized windows, but it would take time since they would need to order the windows.

Mr. Redshaw asked why the building had been condemned, and the applicant indicated that it was from a beam that was in poor condition and which has since been replaced. The applicant noted that they also fixed the unevenness issue with the floors on the interior.

Mr. Shermeyer restated that the applicant is willing to replace the new windows with appropriately sized windows. The applicant indicated that yes, he is, but it will take time, to order, purchase, and install.

Motion: Mr. Shermeyer moved to accept the application for the replacement of the three windows on the second story of the south side with appropriately sized vinyl windows that fit the original opening. Vinyl windows are being approved as this is a non-historic, non-contributing building on an alley. Ms. Pottorff seconded.

Additional Discussion: None.

Vote: 3-1. Motion approved.

Ms. Redshaw voted no as he will not approve vinyl windows on the façade of a building.

Ms. Johnescu recused herself due to the overall condition of the building. She indicated that she could not approve any work on a building that was in this poor condition.

Additional discussion: The applicant asked what other options were available to him besides vinyl windows. Mr. Shermeyer noted that an aluminum clad wood window or a composite material window would be an appropriate style of window. He noted that Anderson, Marvin, Pella, etc. all have an appropriate window. The applicant asked if they were single pane or double pane windows, and Mr. Shermeyer noted that they would be double-pane windows.

Other business:

Adjourning and next meeting **The meeting was adjourned by general consent at 6:30pm; the next scheduled meeting is set for Thursday May 24, 2018.**

Minutes recorded by Mary Alfson Tinsman, JMT Cultural Resource Professional/HARB Consultant

DRAFT