



York Historical Architectural Review Board
Meeting Minutes
February 14, 2019

Members in attendance included: Craig Zumbun (Chair), Dennis Kunkle (Vice-Chair), Mark Skehan Ruth Robbins

Absent: Rebecca Zeller, Mark Shermeyer, Dave Redshaw, Joe Downing, Robyn Pottorff

Consultant: Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/ HARB Consultant

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
Welcome and call to order	<p>The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm.</p> <p>The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.</p>	
Changes to the Agenda		
Minutes of January 24, 2019		Mr. Kunkle moved to approve January 2019 minutes. Ms. Robbins seconded. Approved.
Cases	The following cases are approved with the recommended actions.	

Case #1 – 50 E King Street

Discussion: A request by B Dolan of Mula Design for the replacement of an existing set of aluminum and glass doors on the King Street entry of the property.

The applicant displayed a sample of the door framing and glazing material. He explained that the building is undergoing an interior renovation but that there will be some exterior modifications. He noted that the storefront at 50 E King Street will be replaced by a storefront of the same configuration, utilizing mullions of the same profile and finish as the existing, but with more modern materials, to include thermally broken glass for insulation. He noted that the existing “Salvation Army” logo on the storefront will be retained. The applicant also noted that an exterior air conditioner will be removed and the resulting opening in the brick will be patched.

Mr. Kunkle asked whether there would be any visual changes to the door hardware and the applicant noted that the exterior hardware will be similar to the existing, but the interior panic bar will be slightly deeper and that electric door opening hardware will be added at the interior.

Motion: Mr. Kunkle motioned to approve the application as submitted, and Mr. Skehan seconded.

Additional Discussion: None

Vote: 0-4 approved

Case #2 – 751 S George Street

Discussion: A request by Allied Exteriors for the replacement of an asphalt shingled roof on the property.

The homeowner presented the application. He noted that there would be no change to the profile of the roof and that all materials would be replaced in-kind. He noted that there is slate, asphalt, and rubber roofing present. He stated that the porch roof is rubber and questioned whether that would have been the original material. He stated that he purchased the property a year ago and is completing interior renovations and noted that the only exterior change will be the roof replacement.

Mr. Zumbrun asked about flashing and gutters and the applicant noted they would also be replaced in-kind. Mr. Skehan suggested that the porch might have originally had a standing seam roof and the applicant stated that he looked for historic photos and couldn't find any.

Mr. Zumbrun asked whether the applicant had considered using a rubber synthetic slate roofing tile. The applicant stated he had considered it but was opting for an in-kind replacement of the existing roofing types.

Motion: Mr. Skehan motioned to approve the application as submitted, and Ms. Robbins seconded.

Additional Discussion: None.

Vote: 0-4 approved

Case #3 – 136-140 S Beaver Street

Discussion: A request by SCPII LLC. for the replacement of 83 windows in three adjacent row homes as part of a restoration of those properties.

Joe Musso and associate presented the application. Mr. Musso noted that all of the windows in the three buildings will be replaced. He indicated that this will be a tax credit project and that the Pennsylvania Museum and Historical Commission indicated that they would accept the aluminum clad wood windows on the front facades and fiberglass windows on the sides and rear of the properties.

In addition to the window replacement, there will be repairs to the oriel windows, the slate mansard roofs will be replaced in-kind, and there will be upgrades to existing stormwater features. Replacement

doors for 138 and 140 S Beaver Street will be refabricated based on the existing historic door on 136 S Beaver Street, although without glass, because the other two properties do not have vestibules. The downspouts will be replaced in-kind if the existing cannot be retained.

Mr. Musso noted that the oriel windows will be restored as accurately as possible based on historic photos and existing historic material, some of which is present at 140 S Beaver, and which may be existing beneath the aluminum siding on the other two properties. This includes the ornamental trim, consisting of floral swags, present on the 140 oriel.

Mr. Zumbrun asked about steps and railings at the front entrances and noted that the existing railings are simple pipe rails. Mr. Zumbrun noted that there are similar homes on Market Street which have very simple wrought iron railings. Mr. Musso asked for suggestions and Mr. Zumbrun noted that the powder coated aluminum products that are commonly used have been approved.

The applicants noted that the window replacements will utilize an “insert” or “retrofit” product, in which the new window frame can be set into the existing wood surround with minimal glass loss. For the round-top windows, they will use a “variation product” that will allow them to retain the round top windows with equal-size bottom and top sash. The fiberglass-clad wood replacement windows will be paintable.

Mr. Zumbrun asked about exterior lighting, and Mr. Musso stated that it is proposed to do individual exterior lights on each unit, rather than reusing the shared light between 140 and 138. Mr. Zumbrun noted that the final proposal for exterior lighting could be submitted for staff review.

Motion: Mr. Kunkle motioned to approve the application as presented, and Mr. Skehan seconded.

Additional Discussion: None.

Vote: 0-4 Approved.

Other Business:

26 W King Street: Mr. Musso sought the Board’s opinion on a future project, 26 W King Street, which has existing jalousie windows which need to be replaced. He asked whether the Board would be amenable to the use of vinyl windows on the side elevation of the property and Mr. Zumbrun noted that he feels they are not appropriate for the historic district. He also noted performance deficiencies due to heat and sun exposure, which causes warping and other damage to the vinyl frames. He noted that the applicant would be welcome to propose vinyl windows, but that they are typically not approved by HARB. Mr. Skehan agreed that the windows have durability issues, especially where there is a lot of sun exposure.

301 W Market Street: Mr. Zumbrun noted that removal of the exterior paint on the brick façade of the property using mechanical grinders, which was not reviewed or approved by HARB, was observed at this property and was reported to the city Planning and Zoning Office in order to have the work stopped. JMT visited the property on January 10th and observed no paint removal at that time. Mr. Zumbrun confirmed that the work had occurred within the last week.

Adjourning and next meeting **The meeting was adjourned by general consent at 7:10pm the next scheduled meeting is set for Thursday February 28, 2019.**

Minutes recorded by Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant.

DRAFT