



**York Historical Architectural Review Board  
Meeting Minutes  
March 28, 2019**

Members in attendance included: Craig Zumbun (Chair), Dennis Kunkle (Vice-Chair), Joe Downing, Mark Shermeyer

Absent: Rebecca Zeller, Dave Redshaw, Robyn Pottorff, Mark Skehan, Ruth Robbins

Consultant: Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/ HARB Consultant

<b>AGENDA ITEM</b>	<b>DISCUSSION</b>	<b>ACTION/RESULT</b>
<b>Welcome and call to order</b>	The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm.  The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.	
<b>Changes to the Agenda</b>		
<b>Minutes of March 14, 2019</b>		Mr. Kunkle moved to approve March 14, 2019 minutes. Mr. Shermeyer seconded. Approved.
<b>Cases</b>	The following cases are approved and tabled with the recommended actions.	

**Case #1 – 246 W Philadelphia Street**

A request Zachary Jackson for the replacement of an existing gutter and downspout and replacement and aluminum wrapping of existing wood elements on the façade of the property.

**Discussion:** Mr. Jackson introduced the proposed work and explained that the homeowner would like to replace the existing gutter with a five-inch K style gutter and would remove any rotted wood that is found in the process. The rotted wood will be replaced with new wood and then wrapped in aluminum to create a uniform appearance.

The existing gutter is a half round gutter. Mr. Kunkle stated that the Board would like to see a new half round gutter installed.

Mr. Zumbrun asked what the rationale for installing the K style gutter. Mr. Jackson stated that he is representing the application on behalf of his father who is the owner of the company. The K Style gutter is his recommendation.

Mr. Shermeyer stated that the board would approve replacement of the wood elements with a composite material but do not approve of wrapping wood elements. The applicant asked whether painted wood would be acceptable, and the Board indicated that it would be. Mr. Shermeyer stated that while painted wood would be allowable, composite material would likely be more durable. Mr. Zumbrun noted that the Board has allowed K style gutter in the rear of properties but recommend keeping the historically appropriate half round gutters on the facades of properties in the historic district.

Mr. Shermeyer noted that it appears that the original gutter was a concealed gutter with a half round gutter set into it. He noted that the installation appears to be improper and is allowing water infiltration causing damage to the cornice and possibly underlying structural members. He noted that in order to effectively install a working gutter significant repair to the rotted areas of the fascia, soffit, and trim would be needed. He stated that even if the original design was a concealed gutter, its design has been compromised and it should not be redone. He stated that there is precedent for the installation of a K gutter on the block. He indicated that the Board's biggest concern regarding the gutter replacement would be preserving the appearance of the cornice.

Mr. Jackson agreed that conditions may not support the proposed K gutter installation and stated that they may need to remove the existing gutter to really know what they're dealing with. He stated he will need to examine the existing conditions.

The Board requested that in order to evaluate the application, they would like to see a cross section sketch of the existing installation and a sketch of the proposed modification based on the applicant's investigation the existing condition of the wood members.

**Motion:** Mr. Shermeyer motioned to table the application pending further investigation of existing conditions and development of a workable repair, and Mr. Downing seconded.

**Additional Discussion:** The Board noted that a potential option for repairing the decorative wood elements would be use of a consolidant repair system.

**Vote:** 0-4; motion to table approved.

## **Case #2 – 132 S Beaver Street**

The applicant is proposing to repair, replace, and repaint existing one-over-one windows on the façade of the property. The proposed repair and replacement work has already been completed without prior approval (painting was approved in a 2015 Staff Review).

The consultant visited the property and determined that the new windows, which were installed on the second and third stories, are one-over-one wood windows.

**Discussion:** The Board agreed that because appropriate windows have been installed, the application for a certificate of appropriateness for the existing work can be approved. The windows, as installed, are compliant with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and are in keeping with HARB guidelines.

**Motion:** Mr. Shermeyer motioned to approve the application as presented, and Mr. Downing seconded..

**Additional Discussion:**

**Vote:** 0-4; Approved.

**Other Business:** None.

**Adjourning and next meeting**      **The meeting was adjourned by general consent at 6:48 pm the next scheduled meeting is set for Thursday April 11, 2019.**

**Minutes recorded by Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant.**

DRAFT