



**York Historical Architectural Review Board  
Meeting Minutes  
July 11, 2019**

Members in attendance included: Craig Zumbun (Chair), Dennis Kunkle (Vice-Chair), Mark Skehan, Joe Downing.

Absent: Rebecca Zeller, Robyn Pottorff, Mark Shermeyer, Ruth Robbins, Dave Redshaw

Consultant: Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/ HARB Consultant

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
<b>Welcome and call to order</b>	The meeting was called to order at 6:05 pm.  The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.	
<b>Changes to the Agenda</b> None.		
<b>Minutes of June 27, 2019</b>		Mr. Kunkle motioned to approve June 27, 2019 minutes. Mr. Downing seconded. Approved.
<b>Cases</b>	The following cases are approved and tabled with the recommended actions.	

**Case #1 – 244-246 W Market Street:** A request by Russell Oft, Jr. for the replacement of existing windows, doors, and siding on the property.

**Discussion:** The applicant noted that the building has extensive termite damage. The storefront is glass with deteriorated wood mullions. It is proposed to remove the wood and replace it in kind. The existing historic wood is so deteriorated that the historic finish is not apparent. Roof replacement is proposed. If the roof has multiple layers, they will be removed and replaced. If one layer is present the new roof will be installed over the existing.

Fiberglass clad wood windows are proposed for the main façade while vinyl is proposed for the rear. The main structure is brick, except for the second story of a two-story portion in the rear, which is clad

in T1-11. It is proposed to replace the siding with Hardie Plank or similar. Vinyl soffits are proposed for the overhang at rear.

Mr. Zumbrun noted that the Board often allows more flexibility at the rear of the property, where work is less visible, but recommends that vinyl windows are not durable and are not preferred. He noted also that the proposed vinyl soffit is not recommended as it is not a durable or breathable material. Mr. Kunkle noted that he isn't familiar with vinyl soffit configuration. Mr. Zumburn suggested a synthetic polymer type material, such as ASEK or similar.

The Board strongly encourages the use of a more durable window over vinyl in the rear of the property but will not disallow vinyl in this case because the windows will not be highly visible.

The applicant stated that they would like to install a solid steel door with sidelights to replace the existing pair of three-light, two-panel doors at the front façade. Another option would be to install a set of solid steel doors. Mr. Zumbrun noted that the existing doors appear to be a bit later than the existing storefront. The applicant indicated that the existing doors are in very poor condition and security is a concern. Mr. Zumbrun suggested that the doors may be able to be rehabbed using an epoxy product, or perhaps something could be fabricated to replace the historic doors.

The Board agrees that the existing doors are interesting and may be original to the storefront. The Applicant stated that refabricating the existing doors would be expensive. The Consultant indicated that neither of the proposed replacement doors are appropriate to the character of the storefront and overall façade. The Board agreed that the rest of the application is appropriate as submitted but a new proposal is needed for the door. The goal would be to provide a door that is secure but also appropriate to the character of the building.

**Motion:** Mr. Skehan motioned to approve the application as submitted, with the exception of the replacement of the front doors pending additional investigation and an updated proposal from the applicant. Mr. Downing seconded.

**Additional Discussion:** None.

**Vote:** 4-0. The motion to approve the application with the exception of the door replacement passed with all in favor.

**Case #2 – 148 W Philadelphia Street:** A request by Daniel G. Walczyk for the replacement of the existing windows, front door, and the installation of an awning on the front façade of the property.

**Discussion:** The applicant presented an image of the proposed door. The contractor has not been able to locate an eight-panel door to match the existing historic door. The proposed windows are Anderson A Series with simulated divided lights. The applicant would like to propose installing a single, fixed window at the first-floor front.

The Board inquired about the proposed awning and lighting. The applicant stated that the awning will serve as a sign and lighting will be installed underneath. The lights themselves would not be visible.

Mr. Kunkle stated that the installation of a single fixed window at the first-floor front wouldn't be true to the original historic appearance. The applicant stated that the original windows on the front floor were likely six-over-six windows separated by a brick mullion like those on the upper stories and on

neighboring properties, however, the arrangement was altered previously. The first-floor space is a commercial space.

The Board indicated that the replacement of the two first floor front windows with a large single window would not be appropriate. The applicant stated that they would install one-over-one double-hung Anderson A Series windows.

**Motion:** Mr. Kunkle motioned to approve the application as presented, to include replacement of the first-floor front windows with one-over-one, double-hung windows rather than a picture window, and Mr. Skehan seconded.

**Additional Discussion:** None.

**Vote:** 4 to 0. The motion to approve the application as presented as described above, passed with all in favor.

**Other Business:** Resident of 19 South Pine Street received a letter from Columbia Gas indicating that a gas meter would be installed at the exterior of the property. The Board discussed avenues for individual consultation with Columbia Gas, and discussed the possibility of passing a resolution to discourage the installation of utility meters at the exterior of properties in the historic district, which will be further discussed at the next HARB meeting.

**Adjourning and next meeting**      **The meeting was adjourned by general consent at 7:17 pm the next scheduled meeting is set for Thursday July 25, 2019.**

**Minutes recorded by Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant.**