



**York Historical Architectural Review Board**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**September 12, 2019**

Members in attendance included: Craig Zumbrun (Chair), Dennis Kunkle (Vice-Chair), Mark Skehan, Rebecca Zeller, Mark Shermeyer, Joe Downing

Absent: Dave Redshaw, Robyn Pottorff, Ruth Robbins

Consultant: Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/ HARB Consultant

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
<b>Welcome and call to order</b>	<p>The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm.</p> <p>The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.</p>	
<b>Changes to the Agenda</b> Addition of an application for roof replacement at 28 E Jackson Street.	The Board discussed addition the application to the agenda.	The application was added to the agenda.
<b>Minutes of August 8, 2019</b>		Mr. Kunkle motioned to approve August 8, 2019 minutes. Mr. Skehan seconded. Approved.
<b>Cases</b>	The following cases are approved and tabled with the recommended actions.	

**Case #1 – 350 N George Street:** A request by Becky Zeller/Warehouse for the masonry restoration, window replacement, roof replacement, and installation of a new rear entry on the property.

**Discussion:** Ms. Zeller explained that the HARB approved a similar application about two years ago and this application is largely the same except for work at the rear of the property and the replacement of the windows.

She described the scope of work, which involves masonry restoration and parging of exposed exterior brick at the rear of the building following the roofline of the train shed that was removed. Roof replacement will

consist of new asphalt shingles, similar to the existing. The internal gutter will be restored. Woodwork will be repaired using a composite material as needed. The non-historic entry door will be removed and the entryway will be restored to mimic the historic appearance. A gate will be installed in front of the restored entrance. An accessible entrance will be installed at rear.

The historic windows have deteriorated beyond the point of repair. The proposal to replace the windows will include Marvin custom made aluminum clad windows. Windows with straight, rather than curved glass, will be installed in the upper floor of the turret.

Mr. Shermeyer asked whether just the curved glass windows could be restored, but the glass is missing from the majority of the windows. The glass of the basement windows is not curved, it is possible they were replaced at some point in the building's history.

Mr. Shermeyer asked whether the curved window frames will be retained, and Ms. Zeller stated that the trim and the sills would be retained.

**Motion:** Mr. Shermeyer motioned to approve the application as presented, and Mr. Kunkle Seconded.

**Additional Discussion:** Mr. Skehan asked if the accessible entrance would be installed at the rear and Ms. Zeller stated that it would.

**Vote:** 5-0. The motion to approve the application as presented passed with all in favor, with Ms. Zeller abstaining.

**Case #2 – 215 S George Street:** A request by Moises Sanchez for the installation of adhesive signage on the façade of the building (already completed).

**Discussion:** The applicant stated that he has never been to HARB before. Mr. Zumbrun stated that the sign has already been installed without prior approval, and Mr. Sanchez stated that the sign itself was already in place, but the vinyl face is newly applied.

Mr. Shermeyer asked whether there are lights behind the sign to illuminate it. Mr. Sanchez stated that the sign is unlit. Mr. Shermeyer stated that the existing sign itself is modern but predates the HARB. Mr. Zumbrun explained that the Board would have encouraged him to work with a sign maker to design a sign more appropriate to the building and historic district. A plainer sign with plain lettering would be preferred. Something less modern. As it is, the sign is not compatible with the historic district. Mr. Shermeyer noted that the HARB guidelines generally recommend limiting signs to three colors.

Mr. Skehan reiterated that the sign is not appropriate to the character of the district and would not have been approved. Nor would the window signs have been approved, because historically the windows should contain displays.

Mr. Zumbrun explained that the HARB cannot in good conscience recommend the approval of this application. The Board questioned whether the size/number of signs are in keeping with zoning regulations.

**Motion:** Mr. Zumbrun motioned to deny the application as presented, and Mr. Downing seconded.

**Additional Discussion:** The applicant asked what he would need to do to correct the sign. The Board explained that they would like a simpler sign with fewer colors and explained that he should submit a new

application and return with a revised design. They explained that the sign will also need to comply with the zoning regulations.

**Vote:** 6-0 – Motion to deny the application is approved with all in favor.

**Case #3 – 426 W Philadelphia Street:** A request by Rashida Hameed for the replacement of the inappropriate windows and doors with new, historically appropriate windows and the historic door.

**Discussion:** The applicant was not present at the meeting. The Board elected to table the discussion of the application until the end of the agenda.

**Motion:** --

**Additional Discussion:** --

**Vote:** --

**Case #4 – 28 E Jackson Street:** A request by Michael Markel for the replacement of the existing slate shingles on the front mansard roof of the property.

**Discussion:** The applicant stated that an attempted repair of the existing slate failed to stop interior leaking. The leaking is causing interior damage. The applicant stated that there is a mixture of different shingle and gutter types on houses on the block.

Mr. Shermeyer noted that hexagonal shingles are available but is not sure of the cost. The Board discussed that it would be nice if the pattern could be replicated but wouldn't want to see further damage to the structure if the project is delayed.

**Motion:** Mr. Skehan motioned to approve the application as presented with the request that the applicant make a reasonable effort to investigate replicating the shingle pattern without delaying the repair, and Mr. Downing seconded.

**Additional Discussion:**

**Vote:** 6 to 0. The motion to approve the application as presented with the above described request passed with all in favor.

**Case #3 – 426 W Philadelphia Street:** Mr. Zumbrun reopened the case.

**Discussion:** The applicant previously discussed the application with the HARB Consultant, who presented the case. The proposal is to install Andersen A Series Fibrex-clad wood double-hung windows with four-over four simulated divided lights in each window opening on the front façade, including the dormer, three second story, and two first story windows. It is also proposed to reinstall the historic front door, which was retained by the applicant after it was removed. The historic door jambs and trim will be replicated with to match the old as closely as possible.

**Motion:** Mr. Skehan motioned to approve the application as presented, to include the installation of Andersen A Series Fibrex-clad windows, reinstallation of the historic door and replication of the jambs and trim, and Ms. Zeller Seconded.

**Additional Discussion:** None.

**Vote:** 6 to 0. The motion to approve the application as presented passed with all in favor.

**Other Business:** N/A

**Adjourning and next meeting**      **The meeting was adjourned by general consent at 6:45 pm the next scheduled meeting is set for Thursday September 26, 2019.**

**Minutes recorded by Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant.**