



**York Historical Architectural Review Board
Meeting Minutes
September 10, 2020**

Members in attendance included: Craig Zumbrun (Chair), Dennis Kunkle (Vice-Chair), Joe Downing, Mark Shermeyer, Mark Skehan

Absent: Robyn Pottorff, Ruth Robbins

Consultant: Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/ HARB Consultant

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
Welcome and call to order	The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm. The agenda was prepared by the HARB Consultant.	
Changes to the Agenda	--	--
Minutes of August 27, 2020	--	Motion to approve was made by Mr. Downing and seconded by Mr. Kunkle. The minutes were approved with all in favor.
Cases	The following cases were presented.	The following application was approved.

Case #1 – 310 E Market Street: A request by Nathan Bloch for the installation of new vinyl replacement windows on the side of the property.

Discussion: The applicant noted that the proposed project would replace windows on the east elevation of the main block of the building, as well as the rear ell. The proposed replacement windows are vinyl and all of the existing moldings would be retained.

Mr. Kunkle noted that the windows on the east elevation of the main portion of the building (closest to Market Street) will be significantly visible. Mr. Shermeyer noted that vinyl windows might be allowable on the rear ell but indicated that the eastern elevation of the front block of the building would be very visible and recommended that composite, fiberglass, or aluminum clad windows would be appropriate replacements in that location.

Mr. Bloch asked whether the proposed vinyl window replacements would be acceptable on the rear ell, and the Board indicated that they would be as they would not be visible from a main thoroughfare, but cautioned that vinyl windows tend to lack durability.

Mr. Shermeyer asked whether any changes were proposed to the Market Street façade windows, and the applicant indicated that no changes are proposed on that elevation.

Motion: Mr. Shermeyer motioned to approve the application as amended, with the windows facing Market Street to remain unaltered, and the windows on the east façade of the main block of the building (closest to Market Street and facing the YMCA) be replaced with fiberglass, composite, or wood- or metal-clad windows matching the existing windows in size, configuration, and proportion, with all sills, jambs, and moldings retained as-is and shall not be wrapped in any material. The windows on the side and rear of the rear ell may be replaced with the submitted vinyl replacement windows (ProVia Endure EN600 Series), with all sills, jambs, and moldings retained and unwrapped. Mr. Skehan seconded.

Additional Discussion: N/A

Vote: 5-0; the application was approved as presented with all in favor.

Case #2 – 244-246 W Market Street: A request by Rusen Yanik and Russel Oft for the installation of a two-story wood staircase at the rear of the property.

Discussion: The applicant noted that the original proposal, approved by HARB in 2019, included interior access to the upper floor of the building, but that the design had changed and an exterior stair was now needed.

Mr. Shermeyer noted that the Board had approved a stair case design similar to the proposal in the 1980s or 90s in a more visible location. He asked what materials would be used for the railing system, posts, risers, and stringers. The applicant indicated that the railing system would be a vinyl system, color white, and that all structural components, including the treads, would be pressure treated lumber.

Mr. Shermeyer recommended that the proposed installation could be approved if amended to include the application of a solid-hide stain on the pressure treated elements, other than the stair treads. The applicant noted that several other decks and stairs in the vicinity are constructed of unstained pressure treated lumber and agreed that they would use a solid-hide stain in the color white.

Motion: Mr. Kunkle motioned to approve the application as amended, with the installation of a new stair with pressure treated lumber for the structural components, and white vinyl for the railing system (including both the hand rails and guard rails/balusters), with application of a solid-hide stain, in white, for all pressure treated elements except for the stair treads. The use of vinyl elements is acceptable in this location because it is located in the rear of the property, accessing a non-contributing contemporary addition to the property, and will not be readily visible from the surrounding area.

Additional Discussion: Mr. Zumbrun noted that he is opposed to the approval of vinyl components for an installation within the historic district. He noted that, to his recollection, the Board had never recommended the use of vinyl materials and he does not feel that the material ever looks app

Vote: 4-1; the application is approved as amended with four in favor and Mr. Zumbrun against.

Other Business: N/A

Adjourning and next meeting **The meeting was adjourned at 6:35 pm the next scheduled meeting is set for Thursday September 24, 2020.**

Minutes recorded by Christine Leggio, JMT Senior Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant.

DRAFT