



## York City Historical Architectural Review Board Agenda

Thursday, May 12, 2022 | 6:00 PM

Council Chambers, City Hall | 101 S George St, York, PA 17401

1. Call to order
2. Roll call (Buffington, Kunkle, Pottorff, Neff, Shermeyer, Skehan, Zumbrun)
3. Minutes of the previous meeting
4. Unfinished business
  - 4.1. 49-51 S Duke St  
*Tabled in December 2021. The applicant has not yet resubmitted.*
  - 4.2. 408 W Philadelphia St  
*Tabled in March 2022. Applicant did not attend meeting. HARB member request owner representation to discuss alternatives. Timberline or equivalent would be acceptable replacement for slate.*
5. New business
  - 5.1. 316 E Locust St.  
*Tanner J, Martens has submitted an application to install an aluminum platform, vertical platform lifts at the front porch, and a rubber threshold ramp on either side of the front threshold.*
  - 5.2. 237 W Market St.  
*Michelle Hill has submitted an application to install a new fence.*
  - 5.3. 244-256 N George St.  
*Michael Poster has submitted an application for Window replacement, brick pointing, existing detailing restored/maintained. Two story kitchen/dining room addition to the west of the existing Gloria's building. A transparent bar addition to the south with a roof deck and exterior plaza.*
6. Adjournment



## York Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting Minutes

May 12, 2022 | 101 S George St, York PA 17401

MEMBERS PRESENT	MEMBERS ABSENT	STAFF PRESENT
Craig Zumbrun, Chair Dennis Kunkle, Vice-chair	Steven Buffington Mark Shermeyer Robyn Pottorff Mark Skehan Alan Neff	Portia Newman Montanez McMillion

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
<b>Welcome and call to order</b>		<b>Mr. Zumbrun called the meeting to order at 6:00 PM.</b>
<b>Changes to the agenda</b>		<b>No Changes.</b>

### Cases

The following cases were considered as described below.

#### Case #1 – 316 E. Locust St., York, PA

**Applicant: Tanner J. Martens** did not attend

#### DISCUSSION

New business 5.1. 316 E Locust St. Tanner J, Martens has submitted an application to install an aluminum platform, vertical platform lifts at the front porch, and a rubber threshold ramp on either side of the front threshold.

#### ACTION

Mr. Zumbrun moved to recommend approval of the application presented. Mr. Kunkle seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**Case #2 – 237 W. Market St., York, PA**

**Applicant: Michelle Hill** was in attendance

**DISCUSSION**

Michelle proposed to install a wood fence and did so by replacing the old fence with the new one – a picket fence. Mr. Zumbrun doesn't normally approve a picket fence but the fence is already in place absent pre-approved permits. Additionally, fence is not visible to public main thorough fair.

**ACTION**

Mr. Zumbrun moved to recommend approval of the application as presented. Mr. Kunkle seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

**Case #3 – 244-256 N. George St., York, PA**

**Applicant: Michael Poster** was in attendance

**DISCUSSION**

**Michael** proposed to demo said properties and rebuild an exterior plaza named 'Glorius' containing a restaurant, bar, with a roof deck. This plaza had (2) dining spaces on the 1<sup>st</sup> & 2<sup>nd</sup> floors to accommodate 200 customers. Mr. Zumbrun stated that material is easily differentiated to the historical structural base plaza and glass addition along N. George St. is of acceptable design. New addition staircases and plaza are of materials easily identified as not original and not historic and therefore comply with standard #9.

**ACTION**

Mr. Zumbrun moved to recommend approval of the application as presented. Mr. Kunkle seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

**Adjournment and next meeting**

Mr. Zumbrun adjourned the meeting at approximately 7:00 PM. The next meeting is scheduled for May 26, 2022.

Minutes recorded by Portia Newman

**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS**

APPLICATION FOR PROPERTY ADDRESS: 316 E LOCUST ST. YORK, PA 17403

APPLICANT: Tanner J. Martens

At the public meeting held on May 12, 2022, the Board of Historical Architectural Review considered an application for a permit for work to be performed on the above property located with the Historic District.

Proposed Work:

**Applicant proposes to install an aluminum platform, vertical platform lifts at the front porch, and a rubber threshold ramp on either side of the front threshold.**

Effect of the proposed change upon the general historic and architectural nature of the district [1731.09(a) of the Codified Ordinances of York, Pennsylvania]:

*ADA required access is not a permanent change.*

Appropriateness of exterior architectural features which can be seen from a public street or way only [1731.09(b)]:

General design, arrangement, texture, material and color of building or structure and relation of such factors to similar features of other buildings or structures in the district [1731.09(c)]:

*Not physically appropriate to the district; however temporary and able to be removed without damaging the historic home*

Other relevant findings of fact:

WHEREUPON THE BOARD VOTED TO RECOMMEND **APPROVAL** OF THE APPLICATION:

AS PRESENTED IN THE ATTACHED PRELIMINARY REVIEW SHEET.

AS AMENDED FROM THE PRELIMINARY REVIEW SHEET AS FOLLOWS: \_\_\_\_\_

DISSENTING VOTES AND RATIONALE: \_\_\_\_\_

WHEREUPON THE BOARD VOTED TO RECOMMEND **DENIAL** OF THE APPLICATION BECAUSE:

DISSENTING VOTES AND RATIONALE: \_\_\_\_\_

*Craig Zumbro*

HARB Chair

This application was reviewed by York City Council on \_\_\_\_\_ and has been  APPROVED  DENIED

**Sandie Walker, President of City Council**

**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS  
RECOMMENDATION to YORK CITY COUNCIL**

---

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Standards (Department of Interior regulations, 36 CFR Part 67) pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes and occupancy and encompass the exterior and the interior, related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent or related new construction. HARB applies these Standards to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archaeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS**

APPLICATION FOR PROPERTY ADDRESS: 237 W MARKET ST YORK, PA 17401

APPLICANT: Michelle Hill

At the public meeting held on May 12, 2022, the Board of Historical Architectural Review considered an application for a permit for work to be performed on the above property located with the Historic District.

Proposed Work:

**Applicant proposes to install a wood fence.**

Effect of the proposed change upon the general historic and architectural nature of the district [1731.09(a) of the Codified Ordinances of York, Pennsylvania]:

Fence reflects previous adjacent fence and is new painted wood.

Appropriateness of exterior architectural features which can be seen from a public street or way only [1731.09(b)]:

General design, arrangement, texture, material and color of building or structure and relation of such factors to similar features of other buildings or structures in the district [1731.09(c)]:

Fence is not visible to public main thoroughfare

Other relevant findings of fact:

Fence is already in place absent pre approved permits

WHEREUPON THE BOARD VOTED TO RECOMMEND **APPROVAL** OF THE APPLICATION:

AS PRESENTED IN THE ATTACHED PRELIMINARY REVIEW SHEET.

AS AMENDED FROM THE PRELIMINARY REVIEW SHEET AS FOLLOWS: \_\_\_\_\_

DISSENTING VOTES AND RATIONALE: \_\_\_\_\_

WHEREUPON THE BOARD VOTED TO RECOMMEND **DENIAL** OF THE APPLICATION BECAUSE:

DISSENTING VOTES AND RATIONALE: \_\_\_\_\_

Craig Zumbrian

HARB Chair

This application was reviewed by York City Council on \_\_\_\_\_ and has been APPROVED DENIED

Sandie Walker, President of City Council



**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS  
RECOMMENDATION to YORK CITY COUNCIL**

---

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Standards (Department of Interior regulations, 36 CFR Part 67) pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes and occupancy and encompass the exterior and the interior, related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent or related new construction. HARB applies these Standards to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archaeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.



CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS

APPLICATION FOR PROPERTY ADDRESS: 244-256 N George St. York, Pa 17401

APPLICANT: Michael Poster

At the public meeting held on May 12, 2022, the Board of Historical Architectural Review considered an application for a permit for work to be performed on the above property located with the Historic District.

Proposed Work: Applicant proposes to replace windows, brick pointing, existing detailing restored/maintained. Install Two story kitchen/dining room addition to the west of the existing Gloria's building. A transparent bar addition to the south with a roof deck and exterior plaza.

Effect of the proposed change upon the general historic and architectural nature of the district [1731.09(a) of the Codified Ordinances of York, Pennsylvania]:

Sec. of Interior standards #9 material is easily differentiated to historic structural base

Appropriateness of exterior architectural features which can be seen from a public street or way only [1731.09(b)]:

plaza and glass addition along N. George St. is of acceptable design

General design, arrangement, texture, material and color of building or structure and relation of such factors to similar features of other buildings or structures in the district [1731.09(c)]:

New additions staircases and plaza are of materials easily identified as not original and not historic and therefore comply with standard #9

Other relevant findings of fact:

WHEREUPON THE BOARD VOTED TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE APPLICATION:

[checked] AS PRESENTED IN THE ATTACHED PRELIMINARY REVIEW SHEET.

AS AMENDED FROM THE PRELIMINARY REVIEW SHEET AS FOLLOWS:

DISSENTING VOTES AND RATIONALE:

WHEREUPON THE BOARD VOTED TO RECOMMEND DENIAL OF THE APPLICATION BECAUSE:

DISSENTING VOTES AND RATIONALE:

Craig Zumbro

HARB Chair

This application was reviewed by York City Council on \_\_\_\_\_ and has been APPROVED DENIED

Sandie Walker, President of City Council

**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS  
RECOMMENDATION to YORK CITY COUNCIL**

---

---

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Standards (Department of Interior regulations, 36 CFR Part 67) pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes and occupancy and encompass the exterior and the interior, related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent or related new construction. HARB applies these Standards to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archaeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.